

# From bad to worse: How Arther Laffer's "Rich States, Poor States" rankings refute themselves



State	2008		2009				2010				2011				2012				2013													
	Perf. Rank	Outlook Rank	Perf. Rank	Outlook Rank	Predict. 08-09	Actual 08-09	Error 08-09	+/- Predict	Perf. Rank	Outlook Rank	Predict. 09-10	Actual 09-10	Error 09-10	+/- Predict	Perf. Rank	Outlook Rank	Predict. 10-11	Actual 10-11	Error 10-11	+/- Predict	Perf. Rank	Outlook Rank	Predict. 11-12	Actual 11-12	Error 11-12	+/- Predict	Perf. Rank	Outlook Rank	Predict. 12-13	Actual 12-13	Error 12-13	+/- Predict
Alabama	18	18	26	16	0	-8	8	Fail	26	16	+10	0	10	Fail	23	20	+10	+3	7	Match	22	21	+3	+1	2	Match	30	20	+10	-8	18	Fail
Alaska	31	38	25	38	-7	+6	13	Fail	9	22	-13	+16	29	Fail	7	29	-13	+2	15	Fail	5	29	-22	+2	24	Fail	11	18	-7	-6	1	Match
Arizona	3	2	8	3	+1	-5	6	Fail	8	3	+5	0	5	Fail	15	12	+5	-7	12	Fail	11	9	+3	+4	1	Match	8	7	+1	+3	2	Match
Arkansas	32	15	15	12	+17	+17	0	Match	17	13	+3	-2	5	Fail	10	13	+4	+7	3	Match	10	11	-3	0	3	Fail	21	26	-5	-11	6	Match
California	29	41	27	43	-12	+2	14	Fail	38	46	-16	-11	5	Match	46	47	-8	-8	0	Match	47	38	-1	-1	0	Match	43	47	-4	+4	8	Fail
Colorado	7	7	10	2	0	-3	3	Fail	15	2	+8	-5	13	Fail	24	6	+13	-9	22	Fail	24	8	+18	0	18	Fail	16	22	-6	+8	14	Fail
Connecticut	40	39	37	32	+1	+3	2	Match	46	36	+5	-9	14	Fail	43	35	+10	+3	7	Match	44	44	+8	-1	9	Fail	45	44	+1	-1	2	Fail
Delaware	15	22	28	31	-7	-13	6	Match	30	37	-3	-2	1	Match	32	34	-7	-2	5	Match	35	34	-2	-3	1	Match	26	27	-1	+9	10	Fail
Florida	2	14	2	11	-12	0	12	Fail	6	5	-9	-4	5	Match	8	10	+1	-2	3	Fail	13	13	-2	-5	3	Match	19	16	+3	-6	9	Fail
Georgia	23	8	20	8	+15	+3	12	Match	27	9	+12	-7	19	Fail	33	11	+18	-6	24	Fail	33	10	+22	0	22	Fail	27	9	+18	+6	12	Match
Hawaii	37	45	21	41	-8	+16	24	Fail	16	39	-20	+5	25	Fail	12	46	-23	+4	27	Fail	15	46	-34	-3	31	Match	17	36	-19	-2	17	Match
Idaho	10	9	7	14	+1	+3	2	Match	10	7	-7	-3	4	Match	17	5	+3	-7	10	Fail	17	6	+12	0	12	Fail	10	5	+5	+7	2	Match
Illinois	48	42	48	44	+6	0	6	Fail	48	47	+4	0	4	Fail	48	44	+1	0	1	Fail	48	48	+4	0	4	Fail	46	48	-2	+2	4	Fail
Indiana	46	12	47	17	+34	-1	35	Fail	47	20	+30	0	30	Fail	47	16	+27	0	27	Fail	46	24	+31	+1	30	Match	38	3	+35	+8	27	Match
Iowa	45	27	45	35	+18	0	18	Fail	41	28	+10	+4	6	Match	28	23	+13	+13	0	Match	28	22	+5	0	5	Fail	24	25	-1	+4	5	Fail
Kansas	36	29	42	24	+7	-6	13	Fail	40	25	+18	+2	16	Match	34	27	+15	+6	9	Match	39	26	+7	-5	12	Fail	32	15	+17	+7	10	Match
Kentucky	30	46	31	36	-16	-1	15	Match	31	40	-5	0	5	Fail	31	40	-9	0	9	Fail	32	39	-9	-1	8	Match	28	39	-11	+4	15	Fail
Louisiana	43	21	35	18	+22	+8	14	Match	34	16	+17	+1	16	Match	27	15	+18	+7	11	Match	25	19	+12	+2	10	Match	29	29	0	-4	4	Fail
Maine	16	44	24	47	-28	-8	20	Match	19	44	-23	+5	28	Fail	20	48	-25	-1	24	Match	23	47	-28	-3	25	Match	42	40	+2	-19	21	Fail
Maryland	12	32	17	28	-20	-5	15	Match	20	29	-11	-3	8	Match	21	21	-9	-1	8	Match	21	20	0	0	0	Match	31	34	-3	-10	7	Match
Massachusetts	35	26	36	26	+9	-1	10	Fail	43	32	+10	-7	17	Fail	45	24	+11	-2	13	Fail	43	25	+1	+2	19	Match	41	28	+13	+2	11	Match
Michigan	50	16	50	34	+34	0	34	Fail	50	26	+16	0	16	Fail	50	25	+24	0	24	Fail	50	17	+25	0	25	Fail	50	12	+38	0	38	Fail
Minnesota	26	35	34	40	-9	-8	1	Match	36	38	-6	-2	4	Match	41	37	-2	-5	3	Match	41	41	+4	0	4	Fail	33	46	-13	+8	21	Fail
Mississippi	42	23	39	19	+19	+3	16	Match	42	18	+20	-3	23	Fail	39	19	+24	+3	21	Match	36	15	+20	+3	17	Match	39	14	+25	-3	28	Fail
Missouri	39	17	44	23	+22	-5	27	Fail	35	15	+21	+9	12	Match	38	9	+20	-3	23	Fail	38	7	+29	0	29	Fail	40	24	+16	-2	18	Fail
Montana	5	33	4	30	-28	+1	29	Fail	2	33	-26	+2	28	Fail	3	36	-31	-1	30	Match	3	36	-33	0	33	Fail	5	43	-38	-2	36	Match
Nebraska	41	34	33	29	+7	+8	1	Match	29	34	+4	+4	0	Match	26	32	-5	+3	8	Fail	20	31	-6	+6	12	Fail	20	35	-15	0	15	Fail
Nevada	14	11	9	7	+3	+5	2	Match	13	11	+2	-4	6	Fail	18	17	+2	-5	7	Fail	18	18	+1	0	1	Fail	7	8	-1	+11	12	Fail
New Hampshire	19	20	19	37	-1	0	1	Fail	28	30	-18	-9	9	Match	29	28	-2	-1	1	Match	34	28	+1	-5	6	Fail	34	32	+2	0	2	Fail
New Jersey	38	43	40	46	-5	-2	3	Match	39	48	-6	+1	7	Fail	42	45	-9	-3	6	Match	45	42	-3	-3	0	Match	48	45	+3	-3	6	Fail
New Mexico	8	28	13	25	-20	-5	15	Match	5	35	-12	+8	20	Fail	5	39	-30	0	30	Fail	6	35	-34	-1	33	Match	23	37	-14	-17	3	Match
New York	47	49	43	50	-2	+4	6	Fail	37	50	-7	+6	13	Fail	40	50	-13	-3	10	Match	40	50	-10	0	10	Fail	35	50	-15	+5	20	Fail
North Carolina	25	19	23	21	+6	+2	4	Match	23	21	+2	0	2	Fail	22	26	+2	+1	1	Match	27	23	-4	-5	1	Match	12	6	+6	+15	9	Match
North Dakota	22	24	14	13	-2	+8	10	Fail	11	12	+1	+3	2	Match	4	7	-1	+7	8	Fail	4	5	-3	0	3	Fail	4	4	0	0	0	Match
Ohio	49	47	49	45	+2	0	2	Fail	49	42	+4	0	4	Fail	49	38	+7	0	7	Fail	49	37	+11	0	11	Fail	49	23	+26	0	26	Fail
Oklahoma	9	13	12	15	-4	-3	1	Match	7	14	-3	+5	8	Fail	9	14	-7	-2	5	Match	9	14	-5	0	5	Fail	9	21	-12	0	12	Fail
Oregon	28	36	29	39	-8	-1	7	Match	25	41	-10	+4	14	Fail	30	43	-16	-5	11	Match	26	45	-13	+4	17	Fail	13	42	-29	+13	42	Fail
Pennsylvania	44	37	46	42	+7	-2	9	Fail	46	43	+4	0	4	Fail	37	41	+3	+9	6	Match	30	40	-4	+7	11	Fail	37	33	+4	-7	11	Fail
Rhode Island	24	48	30	48	-24	-6	18	Match	33	45	-18	-3	15	Match	35	42	-12	-2	10	Match	37	43	-7	-2	5	Match	47	41	+6	-10	16	Fail
South Carolina	21	25	18	20	-4	+3	7	Fail	24	31	-2	-6	4	Match	25	22	-7	-1	6	Match	29	27	+3	-4	7	Fail	22	31	-9	+7	16	Fail
South Dakota	13	3	11	5	+10	+2	8	Match	12	4	+6	-1	7	Fail	11	2	+8	+1	7	Match	7	2	+9	+4	5	Match	15	2	+13	-8	21	Fail
Tennessee	27	5	32	9	+22	+5	27	Fail	32	10	+23	0	23	Fail	36	8	+22	-4	26	Fail	31	12	+28	+5	23	Match	25	19	+6	+6	0	Match
Texas	1	10	1	10	-9	0	9	Fail	3	19	-9	-2	7	Match	2	18	-16	+1	17	Fail	2	16	-16	0	16	Fail	1	13	-12	+1	13	Fail
Utah	20	1	22	1	+19	-2	21	Fail	18	1	+21	+4	17	Match	14	1	+17	+4	13	Match	12	1	+13	+2	11	Match	2	1	+1	+10	9	Match
Vermont	17	50	16	49	-33	+1	34	Fail	22	49	-33	-6	27	Match	19	49	-27	+3	30	Fail	19	49	-30	0	30	Fail	36	49	-13	-17	4	Match
Virginia	4	6	6	4	-2	-2	0	Match	4	8	+2	+2	0	Match	6	3	-4	-2	2	Match	8	3	+3	-2	5	Fail	14	11	+3	-6	9	Fail
Washington	11	31	5	22	-20	+6	26	Fail	14	24	-17	-9	8	Match	13	33	-10	+1	11	Fail	14	33	-20	-1	19	Match	6	38	-32	+8	40	Fail
West Virginia	34	40	38	33	-6	-4	2	Match	21	27	+5	+17	12	Match	16	31	-6	+5	11	Fail	16	30	-15	0	15	Fail	18	30	-12	-2	10	Match
Wisconsin	33	30	41	27	+3	-8	11	Fail	44	23	+14	-3	17	Fail	44	30	+21	0	21	Fail	42	32	+14	+2	12	Match	44	17	+27	-2	29	Fail
Wyoming	6	4	3	6	+2	+3	1	Match	1	6	-3	+2	5	Fail	1	4	-5	0	5	Fail	1	4	-3	0	3	Fail	3	10	-7	-2	5	Match

Average Ranking Error	11.6	11.6	11.9	12.2	13.5
+/- Prediction: Incorrect	54%	58%	50%	56%	62%
+/- Prediction: Correct	46%	42%	50%	44%	38%